



Detection of Salmonella in Wastewater Irrigated Farms in Meknes City, Morocco

Yousra Ameziane El Hassani ^{a*}, Ibrahim El Ghazi ^b
and Fatiha Laziri ^a

^a *Laboratory of Environment, Ecology and Health, Department of Biology, Faculty of Sciences, Moulay Ismail University, Zitoune Meknes, Morocco.*

^b *"Health & Environment" Competence Cluster, Faculty of Sciences, Moulay Ismail University, Zitoune Meknes, Morocco.*

Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/AJAAR/2023/v21i3420

Open Peer Review History:

This journal follows the Advanced Open Peer Review policy. Identity of the Reviewers, Editor(s) and additional Reviewers, peer review comments, different versions of the manuscript, comments of the editors, etc are available here: <https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/98133>

Original Research Article

Received: 28/01/2023

Accepted: 30/03/2023

Published: 03/04/2023

ABSTRACT

The use of polluted water for irrigation is prominent in urban and peri-urban farms in Meknes (Morocco). However, this water may contain many pathogens that cause serious infections. Consumption of contaminated vegetables could be a significant public health problem. Salmonella is a bacteria responsible for multiple body infections, including gastroenteritis, fevers, and more severe symptoms. This study aims to determine the prevalence of Salmonella in urban and periurban farms of Meknes. A total of seventy samples (17 Water, 11 soil, and 42 vegetables) were collected and analyzed using a combination of conventional and molecular methods. The results showed that irrigation water was the most contaminated with Salmonella, followed by soil samples (45.5%) and vegetables (16.6%). This study shows a high prevalence of Salmonella in irrigation water, which can be a source of contamination of crops. It raises public health concerns as farmers and consumers are at risk of infection.

*Corresponding author: Email: yousra9yae@gmail.com;

Keywords: *Salmonella*; irrigation water; polymerase chain reaction; Meknes; Morocco.

1. INTRODUCTION

Salmonella is an enteric bacterium that colonizes the gastrointestinal tract. It is responsible for several types of human infections. It causes many clinical manifestations, such as enteric fever, gastroenteritis. *Salmonella* infections are the most common food-borne illness worldwide. It is transmitted via the fecal-oral route. The most common pathway of infection in humans is the consumption of contaminated food or water.

Worldwide, there is a significant increase in the incidence of foodborne illness associated with the consumption of contaminated fresh produce [1,2]. *Salmonella* is considered the primary pathogen responsible for foodborne outbreaks related to contaminated fruits and vegetables [3]. Contamination of fresh produce is often linked to potential contamination in the agricultural environment prior to harvest, including soil, composted manure, irrigation water [4,5]. Irrigation is an important factor in agricultural production [3]. The presence of salmonella in irrigation water is considered one of the main sources of crop contamination [6,5,7,8].

In Meknes (Morocco), surface water is the major source of crop irrigation for urban and peri-urban farms, despite the fact that it is notoriously prone to contamination. Moreover, farmers are using untreated municipal wastewater to overcome water shortages. Therefore, irrigation water could be a route for pathogen transmission in agricultural produce, and a cause of transmission of foodborne diseases [7,9]. The consumption of contaminated irrigated produce may pose a danger to human health. Identifying the specific source of contamination helps to develop strategies and prevent future outbreaks [10]. Improved diagnostic and detection systems have helped with surveillance of foodborne diseases [11]. The use of conventional culture-based methods is inexpensive, however it can lack sensitivity [12], as well as the possibility of false negative results because of the viable but non-culturable state of existence [13]. The Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR) has proven to be one of the reliable and highly sensitive microbiological methods for the detection and identification of pathogenic bacteria [14]. PCR tests have been developed for the detection of

pathogens in water, food and other environmental samples [15]. This study combined conventional and molecular methods to detect *Salmonella* in irrigation water, irrigated vegetables, and soil.

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1 Description of the Study Area

The study area concerns urban and peri-urban farms located at the three streams that cross the city of Meknes, North East of Morocco (Fig. 1). These farms were chosen because this area is well known for using polluted water for irrigation [16]. The use of contaminated water can be direct through the extraction of sewage/collector water or indirectly through the use of stream water polluted that receive all type of discharges.

The reuse of agricultural wastewater in urban and peri-urban areas of Meknes is vital for socio-economic dynamics, as farmers have no alternative. The livelihood of farmers is essentially based on the agricultural production that it associates with the activities. Agricultural income accounts for 85% of the total income of the small farm [16]. It also contains nutrients that improve crop development [17]. Horticultural crops are the most produced in these areas, sold to local markets in the city, but one can also find arboriculture that supplements the income of some farmers. In some areas, there are small forage and livestock plots [16]. A cross-sectional study was carried out on samples of vegetables, irrigation water and soil from different urban and peri-urban farms in Meknes. The study was conducted from December 2021 to March 2022.

2.2 Sampling and Analysis

The sampling was carried out randomly at various urban and peri-urban farms of the city of Meknes. Samples include irrigation water (surface water (10 samples) and wastewater (7 samples)); crop soil samples (11 samples) were taken from pits 1.2 m and 1 m deep; and irrigated vegetables (42 samples). Three types of vegetables were chosen for this study lettuce (*Lactuca sativa*), beet (*Beta vulgaris*) and radish (*Raphanus sativus*). The cultivated soil samples were taken from the same location in the field as the vegetable samples. All samples were collected under aseptic conditions transported on

ice to the laboratory and analyzed within 24 hours.

The salmonella isolation and identification was carried out according to ISO 6579 standard [18]. The pre-enrichment was done in buffered peptone water. The enrichment was done in Rappaport Vassiliadis Soya broth and Muller-Kauffmann Tetrathionate Novobiocin broth. Selective differential plating was done with xylose lysine desoxycholate (XLD) agar. The identification was made using bacterial identification using the API 20E.

The molecular confirmation was performed as described by Burkhard Malorny and Reiner Helmuth [19]. The primers used are the one that amplify a 284 bp fragment of the *invA* gene encoding the origin of Salmonella DNA replication. The primer sequences were: forward (5'GTG AAA TTA TCG CCA CGT TCG GGC AA3'); reverse (5'TCA TCG CAC CGT CAA AGG AAC C3') designed by Rahn et al. [20].

DNA amplification and detection was done after putting PCR tubes in a thermocycler and perform the following thermal cycle program: An initial denaturation of 1 min at 95°C followed by 38 denaturation cycles at 95°C for 30 s, annealing at 64°C for 30 s, then a final extension for 4 min at 72°C, and a final temperature at 4°C. The 10 µL of each PCR product was electrophoresed on a 1.6% agarose gel (1.6 g/100 ml 1X TBE buffer) colored in an Ethidium bromide solution (0.5 µg ml⁻¹) for 10 min, then visualized under ultraviolet light.

2.3 Statistical Analysis

The data collected were processed and analyzed using Excel. The chi-square analysis (χ^2) was used to determine the association between the salmonella contamination rate and all types of samples, and to determine the link between the type of water used for irrigation and the irrigated produce.



Fig. 1. Map of satellite view of the study area (city of Meknes)

3. RESULTS

A total of 70 samples of irrigation water, soil and vegetables were collected from urban and peri-urban farms in the city of Meknes (Morocco) and examined for Salmonella (Table 1). This study showed that irrigation water had the highest contamination rate of *Salmonella spp* (70.6%), followed by irrigated soil 45.5%, and while vegetables were the least contaminated (16.67%). It was also noted that between the two types of irrigation water used, wastewater samples were more contaminated than stream water.

Among vegetables samples, lettuce was the most frequently contaminated (27.4%), followed by radish (14.28%). All beet samples collected were negative for salmonella (Table 2).

A comparison was made of the frequency of contamination of vegetables and soil irrigated by wastewater and stream water (Table 3). The soil irrigated by wastewater has been the most contaminated 80.0 %. As for vegetables, wastewater irrigated lettuce was more contaminated than the one irrigated with stream water, however the contamination rate of radish was the same for wastewater and stream water.

4. DISCUSSION

The use of polluted water for irrigation may be a vector for the transmission of *salmonella spp* [7,21] (Uyttendaele et al. 2015). Several studies have shown that irrigation water has been the source of salmonella contamination in vegetables [22-27]. As a study conducted in Senegal in 2011 by Ndiaye et al. [25], revealed the serotype of Salmonella isolated from irrigation water were the same found in lettuce.

In Morocco, a case-control study carried out in 1999 in Marrakech by Melloul and Hassani. [23], showed a high prevalence of salmonella in groups exposed to wastewater irrigation. Another study in 2001 by Melloul et al. [24] revealed that serogroups of Salmonella B and C were the most isolated in irrigation waters, and the most found in cultivated vegetables.

In Meknes area, the use of polluted surface water and effluent water is wild spread. This makes vegetables produced likely to be a route for transmission of pathogens and food-borne illnesses. Our study found high salmonella contamination of the irrigation water, no significant difference between wastewater and steam water ($X^2= 1.02$; $p=0.30$), hence this water

Table 1. Frequency of distribution of the contamination of salmonella in all the study samples

| Samples | Number and percentage of positive samples | |
|-------------------------|---|--------|
| Irrigation Water n = 17 | 12 | 70.6% |
| Stream water n= 10 | 6 | 60.0 % |
| Wastewater n = 7 | 6 | 85.71% |
| Soil n=11 | 6 | 45.5% |
| Vegetables n= 42 | 7 | 16.67% |

Table 2. Salmonella contamination rate on wastewater-irrigated vegetables

| Vegetables samples | Number of samples | Number and percentage of positive samples |
|--------------------|-------------------|---|
| Lettuce | 14 | 5 (35.71%) |
| Beets | 14 | ND |
| Radish | 14 | 2 (14,28%) |

Table 3. Occurrence of *salmonella spp* in soil and vegetables samples irrigated with different types of irrigation water

| | Number and percentage of positive samples | |
|---------------|---|--------------|
| | Waste water | Stream water |
| Soil n = 11 | 4/5 (80.0%) | 3/6 (50.0%) |
| Lettuce n= 14 | 4/7 (57.14%) | 1/7 (14.28%) |
| Radish n= 14 | 1/7 (14.28%) | 1/7(14.28%) |
| Beets n=14 | ND | ND |

in the study area does not meet Moroccan standards. This can put farmers and their families at risk of infection as they are the most affected group due to the duration and intensity of their contact with wastewater [28].

The prevalence of salmonella in soil is 45.5%, there is no significant difference between the ones irrigated by the waters of the streams and the ones irrigated by the waters of effluents ($X^2=1.31$; $p=0.25$). Soil contamination with *Salmonella spp* may increase the contamination during vegetable harvesting [29,30]. The study conducted by Guo et al. [31], has reported that Salmonella may attach or penetrate to tomatoes grown in soil contaminated with Salmonella and survive for a long time.

The Salmonella contamination of vegetables produced on urban and peri-urban farms in Meknes was valued at 24.0%. However, there is no significant difference between vegetables irrigated with wastewater and the ones irrigated with stream water ($X^2=0.77$; $p=0.37$).

The prevalence of salmonella varies according to the type of vegetables. Several factors affect the frequency of contamination of vegetables, including the surface properties of products and their water retention capacity [32-34]. In our study, it showed that the prevalence of salmonella differs significantly between the different types of vegetables ($X^2=6.25$; $p=0.03$). Lettuce samples were the most frequently contaminated followed by radish. This can be explained by the fact that lettuce has the largest surface area exposed to irrigation water [35]. Lettuce and radish pose the greatest risk since they are generally consumed raw. Consumption of these contaminated vegetables could pose a health risk to consumers of these products.

5. CONCLUSION

The study showed that wastewater in irrigation could be a risk of contamination of vegetables for farm workers and consumers. It is necessary to adopt the necessary actions to limit the risks associated with the contamination of vegetables by adopting good hygiene practices that involve crop restriction, proper irrigation techniques, and washing of produce, primarily if intended for consumption by an immunocompromised person. Finally, further research is needed to identify the sources of contamination and to develop

strategies to reduce the risk of Salmonella contamination in urban and peri-urban farms.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors gratefully acknowledge the support from Laboratory of Biotechnology and Services of Meknes especially Dr Hannou Najat, for her assistance.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. Salleh NA, Rusul G, Hassan Z, Reezal A, Isa SH, Nishibuchi M, Radu S. Incidence of *Salmonella* spp. in raw vegetables in Selangor, Malaysia. Food Control. 2003;14(7):475–479.
2. Sivapalasingam S., Friedman CR, Cohen L, Tauxe RV. Fresh produce: a growing cause of outbreaks of foodborne illness in the United States, 1973 through 1997. J. Food Prot. 2004; 67(10):2342–2353.
3. Liu H, Whitehouse CA, Li B. Presence and persistence of Salmonella in water: the impact on microbial quality of water and food safety. Front. Public Heal. 2018;6:159.
4. Tauxe R, Kruse H, Hedberg C, Potter M, Madden J, Wachsmuth K. Microbial hazards and emerging issues associated with produce a preliminary report to the national advisory committee on microbiologic criteria for foods. J. Food Prot. 1997;60(11):1400–1408.
5. Islam M, Morgan J, Doyle MP, Phatak SC, Millner P, Jiang X. Persistence of *Salmonella enterica* serovar Typhimurium on lettuce and parsley and in soils on which they were grown in fields treated with contaminated manure composts or irrigation water. Foodborne Pathog. Dis. 2004;1(1):27–35.
6. Solomon EB, Yaron S, Matthews KR. Transmission of *Escherichia coli* O157: H7 from contaminated manure and irrigation water to lettuce plant tissue and its subsequent internalization. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 2002;68 (1):397–400.
7. Steele M, Odumeru J. Irrigation water as source of foodborne pathogens on fruit and vegetables. J. Food Prot. 2004;67(12):2839–2849.

8. Bell, Rebecca L, Julie A Kase, Lisa M Harrison, Kannan V Balan, Uma Babu, Yi Chen, Dumitru Macarasin, Hee Jin Kwon, Jie Zheng, Eric L Stevens. The persistence of bacterial pathogens in surface water and its impact on global food safety. *Pathogens*. 2021;10 (11). MDPI: 1391.
9. Allende A, Monaghan J. Irrigation water quality for leafy crops: a perspective of risks and potential solutions. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health*. 2015;12(7):7457–7477.
10. Liming SH, Bhagwat AA. Application of a molecular beacon—real-time PCR technology to detect *Salmonella* species contaminating fruits and vegetables. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 2004;95(2):177–187.
11. Ailes EC, Leon JS, Jaykus LA, Johnston LM, Clayton HA, Blanding S, Kleinbaum DG, Backer LC, Moe CL. Microbial concentrations on fresh produce are affected by postharvest processing, importation, and season. *J. Food Prot.* 2008;71(12):2389–2397.
12. Liu Y, Cao Y, Wang T, Dong Q, Li J, Niu C. Detection of 12 common food-borne bacterial pathogens by TaqMan real-time PCR using a single set of reaction conditions. *Front. Microbiol.* 2019;10:222.
13. Law JW, Ab Mutalib NS, Chan KG, Lee LH. Rapid methods for the detection of foodborne bacterial pathogens: principles, applications, advantages and limitations. *Front. Microbiol.* 2015;5:770.
14. Malorny B, Tassios PT, Rådström P, Cook N, Wagner M, Hoorfar J. Standardization of diagnostic PCR for the detection of foodborne pathogens. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 2003;83(1): 39–48.
15. Imtiaz J, Hashmi I, Saeed A, Qazi I, Arshad M. Development of PCR protocol for detection of *Escherichia coli* in drinking water. *Water Resour. Manag.* VII; Brebbia, CA, Ed.; WIT Press Southampton, UK. 2013;225–232.
16. Dugué P, Benabed A, Abdellaoui EH, Valette É. L'agriculture urbaine à Meknès (Maroc) à la croisée des chemins : disparition d ' une agriculture marginalisée ou retour de la cité jardin ? Méthodologie Le contexte d ' étude : les situations agricoles dans la ville. 2015 ;3.
17. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO). On-farm practices for the safe use of wastewater in urban and peri-urban horticulture -a training handbook for Farmer Field Schools, Second edition. Rome. 54 pp. Licence: CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO. First edition: 2012; 2019.
18. Da Silva N, Taniwaki MH, Junqueira VC, Silveira N, Okazaki MM, Gomes RA. Microbiological examination methods of food and water: a laboratory manual. CRC Press; 2018.
19. Sachse K, Frey J. PCR detection of microbial pathogens. 216. Springer Science & Business Media; 2003.
20. Rahn K, De Grandis SA, Clarke RC, McEwen SA, Galán JE, Ginocchio C, Curtiss R. 3rd, Gyles CL. Amplification of an *invA* gene sequence of *Salmonella typhimurium* by polymerase chain reaction as a specific method of detection of *Salmonella*. *Mol Cell Probes*. 1992;6(4):271-9.
21. Olaimat, Amin N, Richard A Holley. Factors influencing the microbial safety of fresh produce: a review. *Food Microbiology*. 2012;32 (1). Elsevier: 1–19.
22. Ruiz BG, Espinar AC, Carmona MJ. A comparative study of strains of *Salmonella* isolated from irrigation waters, vegetables and human infections. *Epidemiol. Infect.* 1987;98(3):271–276.
23. Melloul AA, Hassani L. *Salmonella* infection in children from the wastewater-spreading zone of Marrakesh city (Morocco). *J. Appl. Microbiol.* 1999;87(4):536–539.
24. Melloul AA, Hassani L, Rafouk L. *Salmonella* contamination of vegetables irrigated with untreated wastewater. *World J. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* 2001;17(2):207–209.
25. Ndiaye ML, Dieng Y, Niang S, Pfeifer HR, Tonolla M, Peduzzi R. Effect of irrigation water on the incidence of *Salmonella* spp. on lettuces produced by urban agriculture and sold on the markets in Dakar, Senegal. *African J. Microbiol. Res.* 2011;5(19):2885–2890.
26. Traoré, Oumar, Outi Nyholm, Anja Siitonen, Isidore Juste O Bonkougou, Alfred S Traoré, Nicolas Barro, Kaisa Haukka. Prevalence and diversity of *salmonella enterica* in water, fish and lettuce in Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso. *BMC Microbiology*. Springer. 2015;15: 1–7.
27. Henao-Herreño XL, López-Tamayo AM, Ramos-Bonilla JP, Haas CN, Husserl J. Risk of illness with *Salmonella* due to

- consumption of raw unwashed vegetables irrigated with water from the Bogotá River. Risk Anal. 2017;37(4):733–743.
28. World Health Organization. WHO Guidelines for the safe use of wastewater, excreta and greywater. World Health Organization. 2006;1.
 29. Micallef, Shirley A, Rachel E Rosenberg Goldstein, Ashish George, Lara Kleinfelter, Marc S Boyer, Cristina R McLaughlin, Andrew Estrin, Laura Ewing, Junia Jean-Gilles Beaubrun, Darcy E Hanes. Occurrence and antibiotic resistance of multiple salmonella serotypes recovered from water, sediment and soil on mid-atlantic tomato farms. Environmental Research. Elsevier: 2012;114:31–39.
 30. Iwu, Chidozie Declan, Anthony Ifeanyi Okoh. Preharvest transmission routes of fresh produce associated bacterial pathogens with outbreak potentials: A review. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health. MDPI. 2019;16 (22):4407.
 31. Guo X, Chen J, Brackett RE, Beuchat LR. Survival of Salmonella on tomatoes stored at high relative humidity, in soil, and on tomatoes in contact with soil. J. Food Prot. 2002;65(2):274–279.
 32. Shuval H, Lampert Y, Fattal B. Development of a risk assessment approach for evaluating wastewater reuse standards for agriculture. Water Sci. Technol. 1997;35 (11–12):15–20.
 33. Abaidoo RC, Keraita B, Drechsel P, Dissanayake P, Maxwell AS. Soil and crop contamination through wastewater irrigation and options for risk reduction in developing countries, in Soil biology and agriculture in the tropics. Springer. 2010;275–297.
 34. Gu, Ganyu, Laura K Strawn, David O Oryang, Jie Zheng, Elizabeth A. Reed, Andrea R Ottesen, Rebecca L Bell, Yuhuan Chen, Steven Duret, David T Ingram. Agricultural practices influence salmonella contamination and survival in pre-harvest tomato production. Frontiers in Microbiology 9. Frontiers Media SA. 2018;2451.
 35. Samuel Jerry C, Mohammed Clement K, Joseph Kudadam K, Mark Osa A. Microbial contamination in vegetables at the farm gate due to irrigation with wastewater in the tamale metropolis of Northern Ghana. J. Environ. Prot. (Irvine,. Calif). 2013; 2013.

© 2023 El Hassani et al.; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history:

The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
<https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/98133>